

CALDWELL HISTORIC PRESERVATION COMMISSION MINUTES

Meeting of JULY 11, 2018 @ 6:30 P.M. Caldwell Public Library – Idaho Room 1010 Dearborn, Caldwell, Idaho

I. **Call to order.** Chairperson King called the meeting to order at approximately 6:32 p.m.

II. **Roll Call**

Members Present. Jacob King, Don Burwell, Randy Lyons and Nicole Bradshaw.

Members Absent. Megan Dixon and Steve Maughan.

Others Present. Brian Billingsley, Planning, Zoning Director and April Cabello, Planning Technician.

Others Absent. Rob Hopper, City Council Liaison.

III. **Approval of Minutes. None**

IV. **Certificate of Appropriateness Interviews.**

Action Item: CA-18-12. Applicant: 1521 Cleveland Blvd., Rolando Santos. Request for approval to construct two rooms to the existing home.

April Cabello, Planning Technician, City of Caldwell explained that the applicant is requesting to construct two new rooms, one on each side of the home.

Rolando Santos, Applicant, 1521 Cleveland Blvd., gave testimony explaining that on the east side of the home they want to build a bedroom and build a dining room on the west side. The home is small and it needs to be expanded, while matching and preserving the historical nature.

Chairman King asked the commission if they had any questions for staff.

The Commission had no questions for staff.

Ms. Cabello asked the applicant to explain the materials that will be used and explain the extra set of stairs.

Mr. Santos stated that the siding will be milled redwood, the roofing will be architectural style shingles, and the bedroom addition will have a rooftop patio with a little rail. Mr. Santos referred to a home on Dearborn as an example.

Chairman King asked if there would be a seating area on the rooftop patio.

Mr. Santos explained that there is currently a door that comes out of the 2nd floor and that is why he is building a parapet and the handrail.

Commissioner Burwell asked if the current stairs would be removed.

Mr. Santos responded yes they would replace the stairs and incorporate the entry onto the rooftop patio.

Commissioner Lyons asked if there would be no stairs.

Mr. Santos replied that they would remove the current landing and that it would become part of the rooftop patio.

Brian Billingsley, Planning & Zoning Director asked if the windows in the addition areas would match the existing windows.

Mr. Santos responded absolutely and explained the types of windows.

Commissioner Bradshaw asked what the current siding is.

Mr. Santos responded that he did not know.

Chairman King pointed out that the application submitted stated that the current siding was 1 x 6-redwood lap siding and asked if that was a guess.

Mr. Santos responded yes because he did not know what the current siding is.

Chairman King asked if the siding would match the siding currently on the building.

Mr. Santos responded yes.

Commissioner Bradshaw asked if the room addition on the west side would also have a flat roof.

Mr. Santos responded that it would have a hip roof.

Chairman King asked if the eaves on both additions would match flush with the current body.

Mr. Santos responded yes and it will match the 12"soffit currently on the home.

Chairman King discussed the gambrel type of roof and its features.

Commissioner Bradshaw asked why on the dining room is there three windows together and not like the rest of the house.

Mr. Santos responded the layout of the three windows is something he saw on Pinterest and Google Plus.

Chairman King stated that to this particular house the windows do not match the current architectural style of windows but to Mr. Santos point there is a substantial amount of Colonials that do follow this similar pattern, with three windows together.

Chairman King shared that one of the considerations for an addition is the mass in accordance to the lot and many homes on Cleveland Blvd seem to have the south to north orientation. This being a corner lot runs east west, but this home has a smaller footprint.

Commissioner Bradshaw asked about the fencing.

Mr. Santos responded that the fencing would be white picket.

Chairman King asked if any other windows would be replaced.

Mr. Santos responded that the people before them replaced all the windows and did not put in the windows with grids and he is not happy with them and will eventually change them out.

Chairman King stated the replacement windows must be 6 over 1 windows.

Commissioner Bradshaw wondered why there was a door that goes into the top part of the house.

Chairman King responded that according to the architectural survey it has had several modifications and was noted, at one time to have had a second living unit.

Commissioner Bradshaw confirmed the applicant is wanting to keep the door into the top part of the house.

Mr. Santos responded yes.

Chairman King stated that another consideration set by the Standard for Rehabilitation would be if the additions were removed in the future, would there be a substantial modification that would render the unique home unrecognizable from its historic designation and how much of the walls will have to be blown out on each side, will it alter the structure.

Mr. Santos responded that they want to tie into the existing building and drywall over the siding that is already there.

Chairman King confirmed that if in the future for some reason the additions were removed or taken out it would not be a difficult feat going back to its original form.

Mr. Santos agreed that it would not be difficult.

Mr. Santos explained the type and style of railing that he would like to install.

Chairman King stated that the commission could add a condition that once the applicant has drawings of the railings, the applicant will submit them to the city for final approval by the Chairman.

Chairman King asked Mr. Santos to review the addition on the east side.

Mr. Santos responded that the roof on the east side addition would replace the current landing. Door would open to the roof landing with stair access.

The commission and applicant discussed the measurements of the bedroom addition.

Chairman King explained that the commission would review the design of the additions.

Chairman King stated for the record that the east side addition is proposed to meet with the current first level floor to the second level floor and that the handrail and balustrade will match all the way to the ground.

Chairman King stated that the condition if approved, the applicant is to submit new drawings of the handrail and balustrade including the step / landing and how it will look from the roof into the second level doorway.

Chairman King closed the public testimony.

FINDINGS OF FACT:

The Historic Preservation Commission accepts the staff report and the evidence list (consisting of the written and verbal staff report, public testimony, the case file, and the sign-up sheets) and facts brought forward during public testimony.

(1) The following objectives and findings, in addition to those cited under section 02-17-11-01 and 02-17-11-04 of this article, shall be considered where applicable to the proposal:

The Historic Preservation Commission further finds the following:

ALTERATIONS;

That the request is consistent with the Steunenberg Residential Historic Design Guidelines. The Commission finds this finding to be **True**.

That the request is consistent with the Secretary of the Interior's Standards for Rehabilitation and Guidelines for Rehabilitating Historic Buildings. The Commission finds this finding to be **True**.

That the request supports the goals, policies, and recommendations of the City of Caldwell's Comprehensive Plan and the plans referenced therein. **The Commission finds this finding to be True.**

That based on the adopted design guidelines the request will not be incongruous with the historical, architectural, archeological, educational, or cultural aspects of the local district. **The Commission finds this finding to be True.**

NEW CONSTRUCTION;

Review Of Building Mass: That the mass of the building shall be reviewed for its relationship to other buildings within the local historic district. **The Commission finds this finding to be True.**

Proportion Of Building Facades: The height to width relationship shall be compatible and consistent with the predominant architectural character of the local historic district. **The Commission finds this finding to be True.**

Shadow Relief/Design Interest: The exterior of the building shall provide shadow relief and design interest compatible with the architectural character of the local historic district. **The Commission finds this finding to be True.**

Appropriateness Of Materials: The appropriateness of materials shall be reviewed as they relate to building mass, shadow relief, and compatibility with other buildings within the local historic district. **The Commission finds this finding to be True.**

Consistency Of Design: The commission shall find that the design of the project is consistent with the plans and guidelines listed in section 02-17-11 of this article. (Ord. 2905, 9-4-2012). **The Commission finds this finding to be True.**

CONCLUSIONS OF LAW

The Historic Preservation Commission has the authority to hear this case and order that it be approved.

ORDER OF DECISION

Based on the Findings of Fact and Conclusions of Law, the Caldwell Historic Preservation Commission hereby orders that Case No. CA-18-12, a request by Rolando Santos to receive a Certificate of Appropriateness from the Historic Preservation Commission for the addition of two rooms to the existing home, is **APPROVED** with the following conditions:

Siding to be milled wood matching the existing siding.

Windows to be six over one.

Applicant to submit new drawings with the 2nd floor patio balustrades and the step/landing out of the 2nd floor exterior door.

MOTION: Commissioner Burwell **SECOND:** Commissioner Bradshaw **MOTION PASSED.**

V. Audience Participation.

None.

VI. Actions Since Last Meeting.

April Cabello reviewed the Certificates of Appropriateness that were issued by staff:

- CA-18-13. Applicant: 1214 Dearborn Street, Elizabeth Wakeman. Staff Level C of A issued for window replacement on the rear sides and rear of the home.
- CA-18-11. Applicant: 1621 Fillmore Street, John Roeder. Commission Level C of A issued for removal of old deck and stairs, replace with new deck and two sets of stair with the following conditions: cedar shingles and siding, posts to be wrapped and have decorative top and bottom, deck floor and steps to be trex or like material, wood risers, skirt will be duplicated to keep same look, if porch roof is to be replaced the applicant must submit a new C of A application Chairman approval.

VII. Old Business.

Action Item: Continued discussion: notifying New Owners in the District. April C. reported that she has two separate lists that she will review for new owners and send out the newsletter with the code. Brian B. suggested using the same letter used from the last mailing.

Action Item: Update CA-16-11. Applicant: 424 S 20th Avenue, Fencing. Brian B. reported that he spoke with the City Attorney whom wrote a letter last year to Mr. Shishmanian and per the attorney if nothing has happened,

and then would be forwarded to the prosecuting attorney's office. The prosecuting attorney called him that day and stated that the case has merritt and to go forward with the case. The prosecuting attorney suggested writing a letter to Mr. Shishmanian explaining that he would have two weeks from the date of the letter to either apply for a variance; or remove the fence; or move the fence back to the setback requirement before the city presses charges. If Mr. Shishmanian complies with one of the options then the city will not press charges. The commission and staff held a conversation regarding the Steunenber Residential fencing code and possible fencing ordinance changes.

VIII. New Business.

None.

IX. Commission & Staff Reports.

Staff Report:

Brian B. shared with the commission that State Legislature changed how agendas need to be published and approved which took effect July 1, 2018. Agendas cannot be amended to add an action item; that would be illegal.

Commission Report:

X. Meeting adjourned at approximately 7:41 p.m.

Respectfully submitted by April Cabello,

MINUTES APPROVED AND SIGNED BELOW BY CHAIRPERSON KING ON THE DATE NOTED BELOW.

Chairperson King

Date

ATTEST: Brian Billingsley, P&Z Director

Date

For detailed minutes, please request a copy of the digital recording.