

# CALDWELL HISTORIC PRESERVATION COMMISSION MINUTES

## Meeting of February 27, 2019 @ 6:30 P.M. Caldwell Public Library – Idaho Room 1010 Dearborn, Caldwell, Idaho

I. **Call to order.** Chairperson King called the meeting to order at approximately 6:30 p.m.

II. **Roll Call**

**Members Present.** Jacob King, Randy Lyons, Steve Maughan and Nicole Bradshaw.

**Members Absent.** Megan Dixon.

**Others Present.** Brian Billingsley, Planning, Zoning Director; and April Cabello, Planning Technician.

**Others Absent.** Rob Hopper, City Council Liaison.

III. **Approval of Minutes.**

APPROVAL OF MINUTES OF February 13, 2019 continued the next meeting, no minutes to be approved from January 23, 2019 as that meeting was canceled.

IV. **Certificate of Appropriateness Interviews.**

**Action Item: CA-19-01.** Applicant: John Hogg, 627 N. Homedale Ave. Request for approval to replace existing siding, exterior door, resize and replace windows at 1823 Cleveland Blvd.

John Hogg, Applicant, 627 N. Homedale Ave. gave testimony explaining that he would like approval to replace the existing fiber cement siding with Tru-wood siding, replace the existing steel exterior door with a fiberglass or steel door, resize and replace existing aluminum and vinyl windows with vinyl single hung and slider windows at his property, 1823 Cleveland Blvd located in the Steunenbergh Residential Historic District. Mr. Hogg stated that the goal is to complete the renovation of the property; they are doing an interior remodel and he wants to make it more functional on the outside. Over the years, the previous owners have done piecemeal remodels and closed in porches. He wants to give it a better appearance from the outside and make it a functioning residence. He is looking to keep everything as close to the same, but a few of the windows are hazardous if they are not openable and he is looking to change the sizes on the windows to make it more functional. He wants to give the home a fresh look.

Chairman King stated that the home has noticeably different siding and that the home has a craftsman element without a porch. It is obvious the porch was enclosed.

Chairman King asked the applicant if he has done work in the district.

Mr. Hogg responded that he previously owned a home on Blaine Street, which he did some work on and he has done work on family member's homes.

The commission discussed the current shingle siding and piecemealed diagonal siding on the front where it appears the porch was enclosed. The commission discussed the

Tru-Wood proposed siding being a new type to the commission and asked the applicant to describe the proposed Tru-Wood siding.

Mr. Hogg explained that the Tru-Wood siding is a composite, synthetic wood siding that can make lap siding. Mr. Hogg further explained under the existing shingle siding is the original 6 inch cedar lap siding that is not in a shape to be used.

Chairman King asked if the Tru-Wood siding has an irregular pattern and what size.

Mr. Hogg confirmed the irregular pattern and the size is 7 ½ inch or 5 inch.

Commissioner Maughan stated it should be closest to the original as possible.

Commissioner Bradshaw stated that it looked like some of the other homes in the neighborhood have 5 inch siding.

Chairman King agreed 5 inch and stated that from a Historical Preservation standpoint, closest to what it was is better and a lot of the craftsman style have 4 to 5 inch lap boards.

Chairman King asked about the window trim.

Mr. Hogg responded that they have a Tru-Wood trim that matches the siding and he would trim it out with a 3 1/2inch board that would lap over the lap siding.

Commissioner Maughan explained that currently the home does not look like it did to begin with and thinks what the applicant is proposing is fantastic because it gets the home much closer to the original neighborhood look.

Troy and Jerry Cunningham, in favor of the application, shared that historically this home was a very attractive place and kept immaculate. Over the years with new owners it has become a dump, they have called Code Enforcement 4 or 5 times every year for years to have the weeds mowed down.

Chairman King and Commissioner Maughan discussed the awnings, and how the home looked when it was first built. They wondered if the builder or architect who built the home could look at it and know it was the home they built. This home is very far from what it looked like when it was built and the proposal is a movement back to what it should look like.

Mr. Hogg responded that it is his intent to have someone at a higher level to live in the home.

Commissioner Bradshaw asked the applicant about the placement of the existing front windows and that the placement seems off.

Mr. Hogg responded that the front originally was a porch, and 3 quarters of the house must have been a porch. He thinks there was a back porch, side porch and a huge front porch but everything has been converted.

Commissioner Bradshaw stated that windows are a key element in a historic house and wanted to know if the applicant is looking to do a similar style to the neighboring homes.

Mr. Hogg responded he was not but could be open to doing smaller sets of windows and framing them into the large space. He planned to replace the front windows as is.

Chairman King reviewed page 3 of the plans submitted with the application confirming what windows would be resized and what windows would be sliders. Chairman King asked Commissioner Bradshaw to reiterate her suggestion of double hung windows instead of slider windows.

Mr. Hogg responded that front south facing side is on page 3, A1.

Commissioner Maughan stated that it was obvious because of the infill that there was a set of three double hung windows on the front left hand side of the house.

Commissioner Maughan shared the preference of the commission that the replacement windows would be similar to the original size and design.

Mr. Hogg stated that there is a bedroom on the left hand side and that it might be hard to make it esthetically correct interior wise with several small windows.

Commissioner Maughan stated that it is the commission's intent to converge the windows back to the original design.

Commissioner Lyons asked the applicant if there are 2 layers of siding all around the house.

Mr. Hogg responded, yes it was all lap siding at one point and the additions on the west facing side do not have original lap siding underneath. That is probably when the house was re-sided, sometime in the 40's or 50's. The original siding looks to have been cedar lap siding.

Chairman King stated that looking at the front, he noticed that the profile does not follow one single continuous line along the bottom of the windows and especially with the window on the right side of the front door as it almost butts up to the doorway. He wondered if the window could be moved over.

Mr. Hogg responded, yes, that is his intention. However, inside there is a corner gas fireplace and no room on that side to add a window in the corner. On the interior left side, a bedroom wall cuts right to the side of the window. Even adding in single windows, they will not be a great size and will still be off set. He will not be able to get the windows symmetrical with the center doorway. He further stated that he would like to get everything more in a line or some sort of symmetry, get it lined up more correctly.

Chairman King stated that symmetry is a level of importance to him.

Commissioner Maughan stated that he does not know if the concrete that leads to the front door is original or not, it might have had a wooden porch. It is almost impossible to tell but he has a notion that this is a classically symmetrical bungalow and that it probably had a portico entry of some sort with double hung windows in the front. Anything that the commission approves that gets the home closer to the original is a win.

Chairman King agreed with Commissioner Maughan.

Chairman King asked the applicant if the proposed door would be fiberglass with windows at the top and paneling.

Mr. Hogg responded that the door is a craftsman's style, with two long vertical panels with six grid window.

Chairman King explained that it is not recommended changing the size of windows facing 19<sup>th</sup> but agrees with Commissioner Maughan's thoughts about going back to the original. Since the window butts up against the door, he is happy with moving the window over.

Mr. Hogg responded that is a bedroom and for safety reasons it would need an openable window.

Mr. Maughan wanted to confirm that the awnings are going away.

Mr. Hogg acknowledged they removed the awnings but the awnings are on the property.

Commissioner Bradshaw asked the applicant if they are able to do double hung windows on the front and on the street side.

Mr. Hogg responded that on the side, he was hoping to keep the windows continuous with the far back corner windows. Mr. Hogg further stated that the back of the home has 5 ft by 3ft windows and he hoped to keep the street side and rear windows all the same size and pattern.

Commissioner Maughan again stated that anything the applicant does to the home will be an improvement and if the front of the house that looks out on Cleveland has double hung windows and similar to size and appearance of the houses on either side, that would be a win. The current plan does not specify double hung windows in the front. Commissioner Maughan asked the applicant if they would be amenable to the suggestion, and would agree that they will try to replicate the look of the double hung windows surrounding this property.

Mr. Hogg responded he would be amenable to it but the only concern he has is that he may not be able to do exactly what the commission is hoping for size wise.

Commissioner Maughan expressed his desire for 2 double hung windows, on both sides of the door.

Commissioner Lyons shared that the Secretary of the Interior's Standards for Rehab guidelines says, as similar to the original profile for windows and doors. It would be the commission's suggestion to regain the integrity of the district.

Mr. Hogg responded that his intention is not to detract from anything in the district.

Commissioner Maughan asked staff if there is a way to expedite without another hearing.

April Cabello, staff, responded that the commission might put a condition that the Chair has the authority to approve any changes to the windows.

Chairman King asked staff if there is a way to approve the application with double hung windows contingent on the fit.

Mr. Hogg stated the building department would need to be involved if the structure of the home is changed but will do what he can to put in vertical double hung windows.

Commissioner Maughan made a motion to recommend approval with 1 or 2 double hung windows on either side of the door as they will fit in existing window openings; based upon the structural issues that might be revealed, the Chairman is authorized to approve change away from the double hung windows. The siding is to be replaced with Tru-Wood Cottage Lap Siding with a 5 ½ or 6 inch lap; front door to be replaced with a door that has 6 lights and 2 panels.

**Motion to Approve Case Number CA-19-01:**

**MOTION:** Commissioner Maughan **SECOND:** Commissioner Bradshaw **MOTION PASSED WITH A UNANIMOUS VOTE.**

**V. Audience Participation.** None.

**VI. Actions Since Last Meeting.** None.

**VII. Old Business.**

**Action Item:** CA-16-11. Applicant: 424 S 20<sup>th</sup> Avenue, Fencing – Continue to future meeting.

**Action Item:** Steunenberg Facebook page – Continue to future meeting.

**Action Item:** News Letter – Continue to future meeting.

**Action Item:** 2019 projects – Continue to future meeting.

**VIII. New Business.** None.

**IX. Commission & Staff Reports.**

**Staff Report:**

April C. reported that CA-18-01. Applicant: 1401 Cleveland Blvd approved in 2018 will expire March 28, 2019.

**Commission Report:**

**X. Meeting adjourned at approximately 7:30 p.m.**

Respectfully submitted by April Cabello,

MINUTES APPROVED AND SIGNED BELOW BY CHAIRPERSON KING ON THE DATE NOTED BELOW.

\_\_\_\_\_  
Chairperson King

\_\_\_\_\_  
Date

\_\_\_\_\_  
ATTEST: Jarom Wagoner, Senior Planner

\_\_\_\_\_  
Date

**For detailed minutes, please request a copy of the digital recording.**