

# CALDWELL HISTORIC PRESERVATION COMMISSION MINUTES

## Meeting of March 27, 2019 @ 6:30 P.M. Caldwell Public Library – Idaho Room 1010 Dearborn, Caldwell, Idaho

I. **Call to order.** Chairperson King called the meeting to order at approximately 6:32 p.m.

II. **Roll Call**

**Members Present.** Jacob King, Steve Maughan and Nicole Bradshaw.

**Members Absent.** Randy Lyons and Megan Dixon.

**Others Present.** April Cabello, Planning Technician; Rob Hopper, City Council Liaison.

**Others Absent.** Jerome Mapp, Interim Planning & Zoning Director; Jarom Wagoner, Senior Planner

III. **Approval of Minutes.**

MOTION TO APPROVE THE MINUTES OF FEBRUARY 13, 2019 and FEBRUARY 27, 2019.

**MOTION:** Commissioner Maughan **SECOND:** Commissioner Bradshaw, **MOTION PASSED.**

IV. **Certificate of Appropriateness Interviews.**

**Action Item: CA-19-02** Applicant: Bryan Fine, 601 S 13<sup>th</sup>, Caldwell, ID 83605. Request for approval to replace existing sliding wood garage door with an insulated Thermcore Steel garage door.

Bryan Fine, Applicant, 1224 Everett Street gave testimony explaining that he would like approval to replace the homemade 72 year garage door that slides sideways since it is rotted due to weathering. He stated that he has expensive tools in the garage and needs to insulate and secure the garage.

Chairman King acknowledged the weather damage done to the garage but wondered if the garage doors are on a slide system.

Commissioner Maughan stated that the rail system is probably original, but wondered if the wood doors are original.

Mr. Fine responded that he does not know if the wood doors are original and shared that he did look for similar doors and what he submitted is the closest he could find to the original doors.

Commissioner Bradshaw asked if it was originally built as a garage.

Mr. Fine responded that the previous owner always used it as a garage.

Commissioner Maughan and Chairman King stated that it was originally a garage.

The commissioners discussed garage door guidelines.

Chairman King stated the garage door is a notable feature of the entire site, the front door and the detached garage is on 13<sup>th</sup> and that is why he called this case to the commission. Even though it is a secondary building, the features are notable.

Commissioner Bradshaw wondered if the garage door would stay on the sliding system.

Mr. Fine responded no and said that he tried to find something with vertical slats to make it look like a sliding door.

Commissioner Maughan stated that there is either a complete replacement or a custom replacement but that is more expensive.

Chairman King shared his concern that the vertical slating of the V-5 and V-10 do fall in line but would the horizontal seams of the door call attention away from the vertical slating.

Chairman King stated that from a historical preservation standpoint, it would be preferable to keep the sliding wood aspect.

Commissioner Maughan stated that garage doors with windows are not what the commission wants.

Councilman Hopper shared that this is a unique situation as most garages in the district are loaded from the alley. In this situation the homeowner does not have much choice of garage doors beyond picking garage doors that is close to the original appearance, which looks like the model the applicant has chosen.

Commissioner Maughan shared that he did find a website, Heritage Hill Web and the advice is if possible to rehang, motorize and create the sliding return but otherwise replicate as much as possible the profile as seen from the street.

Councilman Hopper noted the proposed picture has the appearance of middle handles and wondered if the applicant was planning on that.

Mr. Fine responded that it would be an aftermarket use.

Commissioner Maughan stated that if they make a motion it would clearly need to state to approve a solid garage door with vertical elements as a prominent set of the panels with no windows. Preferably, model 192 V10 model listed by the applicant.

Mr. Fine responded that is going up in price and hoped to go with the V5 model.

Commissioner Bradshaw suggested making a recommendation to add handles so it looks like a slide door to match the period style.

Chairman King acknowledged the applicant's effort on the entire site.

Chairman King stated that he is okay with model V5 circled on the application.

Commissioner Bradshaw agrees that model V10 gives more of the seam in the middle but because the seams on the original garage doors cannot be seen enough to know that they are sliding doors she would be fine with the model V5 with handles.

Commissioner Bradshaw made a motion to approve model #199 V5 garage door in white with two handles in the middle that makes it look like a sliding door without windows.

**Motion to Approve Case Number CA-19-02:**

**MOTION:** Commissioner Bradshaw **SECOND:** Commissioner Maughan **MOTION PASSED WITH A UNANIMOUS VOTE.**

**V. Audience Participation.** None.

**VI. Actions Since Last Meeting.**

- **Discussion Item: CA-19-01.** Commission Level C of A issued for CA-19-01 at 1823 Cleveland Blvd to John Hogg for the approval to replace windows facing Cleveland Blvd. and 19th Ave. with one or two vertical double hung windows. Based upon the structural issues, the Chairman is authorized to give approval changing away from the double hung windows; the siding is to be replaced with Truewood Cottage Lap Siding with a 5 1/2 or 6 inch lap; the front door is to be replaced with a door that has 6 lights and 2 panels.
- **Discussion Item: CA-19-03.** Building Official Level C of A issued for CA-19-03 at 1214 Blaine Street to Judy Subia for approval to demolish this declared unsafe structure and, due to its current structural condition, to order the immediate demotion of the structure.

**VII. Old Business.**

- **Action Item:** CA-16-11. Applicant: 424 S 20<sup>th</sup> Avenue. April C. reported that the applicant emailed stating they would be completing the fencing and come into compliance with the Certificate of Appropriateness that was approved. P& Z gave until June 1, 2019 for the applicant to comply.
- **Action Item:** Steunenberg Facebook page. April C. reported that Steve Maughan, Jan Boles, and Rob Hopper are the FB administrators. Staff would like the commission to handle maintaining and updating the FB page. Rob H. shared that it would be nice to highlight some great things that are happening. The commission would like to add links to the City website, Historic Preservation, and Code Enforcement, as well as links to the Steunenberg Residential Historic District code. Chairman King shared that he likes all the ideas and wants to organize their time together as a commission to work on the FB page and the News Letter. Commissioner Bradshaw suggested taking 10 to 15 minutes after each meeting to update the FB page.
- **Action Item:** News Letter. April C. reported that the commission may work on the newsletter outside the CHPC meeting, but once the newsletter is ready for final review it should be placed as an action item on the CHPC agenda. Chairman King reviewed what needed to be updated and agreed to keep this as an action item on all agendas.
- **Action Item:** 2019 Projects. Chairman King stated that the owner's mailing list and newsletter would be the number one project and made a note to keep this as an action item on all agendas.

**VIII. New Business.**

- **Action Item:** Commission attendance and quorum. April C. expressed her concern for the commission and the attendance because of the CLG status and C of A applications. The commission discussed the number of commissioners

and possibly adding another member or an alternate member; and the commission discussed how to recruit another member.

**IX. Commission & Staff Reports.**

**Staff Report:**

April C. reported that she had reached out to SHPO and Legal Counsel for training sessions but needs dates and times that the commission chooses. The commission would like the training on a regularly scheduled meeting date and time.

April C. suggested updating the Design Guidelines for the Historic District to add types of allowed products.

**Commission Report:**

The commission held a discussion regarding the future building of homes on vacant lots, land use, and design review.

Steve M. asked about the process to trim trees along Blaine and Cleveland since homeowners are coming to him asking about flaggers. Rob H. responded that Blaine and Cleveland are ITD territory and not the city's, and that the homeowner should contact ITD.

**X. Meeting adjourned at approximately 8:12 p.m.**

Respectfully submitted by April Cabello,

MINUTES APPROVED AND SIGNED BELOW BY CHAIRPERSON KING ON THE DATE NOTED BELOW.

\_\_\_\_\_  
Chairperson King

\_\_\_\_\_  
Date

\_\_\_\_\_  
ATTEST: Jarom Wagoner, Senior Planner

\_\_\_\_\_  
Date

**For detailed minutes, please request a copy of the digital recording.**