Caldwell Historic Preservation Commission Minutes

Meeting of September 11, 2019 @ 6:33 P.M.
Caldwell Public Library – Idaho Room
1010 Dearborn, Caldwell, Idaho

I. Call to order. Chairperson King called the meeting to order at approximately 6:31 p.m.

II. Roll Call

Members Present. Jacob King, Randy Lyons, Nicole Bradshaw, Megan Dixon and Steve Maughan.

Members Absent. None.

Others Present. April Cabello, Planning Technician; and Pete L’Orange, Historic Preservation Planner/CLG Coordinator.

Others Absent. Rob Hopper, City Council Liaison; Jerome Mapp, Planning, Zoning Director; and Jarom Wagoner, Senior Planner.

III. Approval of Minutes. August 28, 2019 continued to the next meeting

IV. Certificate of Appropriateness Interviews. None.

V. Audience Participation. None

VI. Actions Since Last Meeting.

Chairman King reviewed the issued Certificates of Appropriateness.

Discussion Item: CA-19-09. Chairman King Commission Level C of A issued for CA-19-09 located at 1523 Dearborn Street for a 6ft solid cedar fence next to the house with an arched gate, 6ft solid cedar fence along the rear property line and a 4ft solid cedar fence along the sidewalk.

VII. Old Business.

Discussion Item: Reminder: April C. reminded the commission of the upcoming CHPC report to City Council on October 21, 2019.
Action Item: Steunenberg Facebook page - continue to the next meeting
Action Item: News Letter – continue to the next meeting
Action Item: Adding a new commission member – continue to the next meeting
VIII. New Business.

Action Item: SHPO Training: Public Meeting / Public Hearing training on new construction.

Pete L'Orange, Historic Preservation Planner/CLG Coordinator gave a PowerPoint presentation on appropriate infill construction in historic districts and discussed the following:

- The district is the resource, not its individual parts.
- Use new construction to reinforce historic significance.
- New construction to complement / support the district.
- Compatible yet distinct.
- Exterior design and patterning reflects district characteristics.

Pete L'Orange reviewed and discussed a case study, several situations in the Caldwell Steunenberg historic district and discussed cut sheet / installation sheets for siding and all products.

Commissioner Bradshaw confirmed with Pete that the point of reference should not necessarily be what had been, but that it should be evaluating what is around it in the historic district, especially contributing today. Pete L'Orange responded that unless the applicant can document with photographs or plans that they are taking the home back to a very specific design at a very specific period, date, then it is okay to rely on that.

Chairman King asked about criteria for infill versus a rebuild. Pete L'Orange stated that there are many similarities. When the original building is gone, anything built in its place is considered infill. If someone is doing a true reconstruction, it is a very specific type of construction, same period materials, same mortar mix, same design, no modern material replacement is allowed. It is not okay to use the words reconstruction, restore or restoration; to use those words they must follow strictly Secretary of the Interior’s Standards for Rehabilitation Guidelines. Commissioner Dixon confirmed for a rebuild the commission is not required to make the home look like a certain period of time. Pete responded it should fall within the period of significance for the district.

Chairman King asked about contributing versus non-contributing, and how far do they require non-contributing structures to match contributing structures, or if one wanted a non-contributing structure going toward what contributing structures look like. Pete L’Orange responded that if the non-contributing structure can prove it looked like a contributing structure then that is fine. Avoid speculative history.

IX. Commission & Staff Reports.

Staff Report:

April C. reminded the commission of their report to City Council on October 21, 2019.

April C. reported that the September 25, 2019 meeting canceled.
Commission Report:

The commission asked staff to contact legal counsel about how to add a requirement to code for when a property transfers from homeowner A to homeowner B to have the wording on the tax roll and deed “Steunenberg Historic District within this lot and block in this subdivision”.

The commission asked staff to find out the appeal process and the recommendation of a special use application.

X. Meeting adjourned at approximately 8:38 p.m.

Respectfully submitted by April Cabello,

MINUTES APPROVED AND SIGNED BELOW BY CHAIRPERSON KING ON THE DATE NOTED BELOW.

________________________________________  ______________________
Chairperson King                          Date

________________________________________  ______________________
ATTEST: Jerome Mapp, Planning Director   Date

For detailed minutes, please request a copy of the digital recording.