

CALDWELL HISTORIC PRESERVATION COMMISSION MINUTES

**Meeting of April 12, 2017 @ 6:30 P.M.
Caldwell Public Library – Idaho Room
1010 Dearborn, Caldwell, Idaho**

I. Call to order. Chairperson Maughan called the meeting to order at approximately 6:32 p.m.

II. Roll Call

Members Present. Steve Maughan, Randy Lyons, Megan Dixon, Don Burwell and Nicole Bradshaw.

Members Absent. None.

Others Present.; Brian Billingsley, Planning & Zoning Director and April Cabello, Planning Technician.

Others Absent. Jarom Wagoner, Senior Planner and Rob Hopper, City Council Liaison.

III. Approval of Minutes.

Minutes of March 22, 2017 were continued to May 10, 2017

IV. Certificate of Appropriateness Interviews.

Case Number: CA-17-01. Applicant: Jack Verdine; Representative: ABC Seamless, Steve Burak: A request to alter the siding by replacing the beatup, broken siding with Seamless T3 to make it look as it was originally constructed, not altering the rafts, soffit, fascia or window trims. Subject Property is located at: 1201 Cleveland Blvd.

Steve Burak, ABC Seamless, 132 E State Street Eagle ID, applicant's representative signed in favor of the application and gave supporting testimony.

Mr. Burak explained the type of material that is used in his product and that it does not have any ugly joints which will look more like what was on this home originally and stated that what is currently on the home is asbestos siding.

Commissioner Burwell wondered if the existing siding had been tested to confirm it was asbestos siding.

Mr. Burak responded that he had been working with asbestos siding since he was young and knows his siding and that yes this is asbestos siding. To remove this siding you have to wear masks and double bag the siding, it gets really expensive so they encapsulated it by putting foam insulation over it and will leave it so it does not get disturbed so you don't have to mess with it.

Commissioner Dixon confirmed that the insulation is what is showing in the picture of the home from April 6, 2017.

Mr. Burak responded yes.

Commissioner Dixon asked the applicants representative to speak to the kinds of houses, time vintage and siding that were resided in Boise.

Mr. Burak responded that most the homes had similar siding to the subject house but most were wood. The homes were mostly of the same time period along Harrison Blvd and North End.

Chairman Maughan confirmed that the homes his company worked on in Boise were not covering existing wood lap siding that was repairable.

Mr. Burak responded no, that most homeowners wanted maintenance free siding.

Commissioner Dixon asked to confirm with the applicant's representative that each home that they replaced the siding in a Boise Historic District was approved as a convince to the homeowner.

Mr. Burak responded that he would say it was not a convenience but rather a maintenance aspect for the homeowner.

Chairman Maughan asked the applicant if they were aware the subject home here in Caldwell within the Steunenburg Historic District.

Mr. Burak responded that he had no clue.

Commissioner Dixon stated to staff, for this commission she felt it would be helpful to compare the approval process for the Boise Historic District.

Commissioner Dixon confirmed with the applicant's representative that they made a statement each time to the Boise Historic Preservation Commission for each job.

Mr. Burak responded that no they don't, they just go get a permit.

Brian Billingsley, Director of Planning and Zoning, asked the applicant's representative for any documentation that can be provided to the commission regarding the homes that were granted Certificate of Appropriateness for steel siding in Boise.

Mr. Burak responded that no Certificate of Appropriateness but has building permits.

Chairman Maughan asked staff if they had knowledge of the City of Boise Historic District procedure.

Mr. Billingsley responded that he did not have knowledge of the City of Boise Historic District procedures.

Mr. Billingsley also stated that he would like to see the documentation and addresses so he may contact the City of Boise Planning and Zoning to do some research.

Commissioner Dixon stated it would be very helpful to hear the decisions of Boise but in the context that the Caldwell Historic Preservation has to operate in, this is a really unusual situation that is not covered in as much detail as replacing or persevering and it is very clear that something has to be done if the asbestos is deteriorating.

Mr. Burak stated that the problem with asbestos is it would cost the homeowner somewhere close to \$40,000.00 to add the removal and then replace with wood.

Mr. Billingsley stated that the documentation received from the applicant's representative are not Certificate of Appropriateness but are Building Permits which were issued back in the 1990's.

Chairman Maughan stated that the project has been started which is a concern for the homeowner and for folks in the neighborhood but the commission is in a very difficult situation with regards to giving an approval without further investigation.

Jack Verdine, applicant, signed in favor of the application and stated that the only reason he is doing this work to the house is to make it look better.

Commissioner Burwell asked the applicant if he was aware that he was in the Stenuenberg Historic District.

Mr. Verdine responded no, at first he wasn't. Now he realizes what he is dealing with.

Chairman Maughan stated for the record that the commission had approved an outbuilding that had to be relocated about three years ago.

David Kengon, signed in favor of the application and stated that the existing siding is starting break up pretty bad and something has to be done. With Jack Verdine's income he is not able to remove all the old siding and reside.

Commissioner Dixon expressed her concern to the commission about this case making a precedent and not making this part of a permitting process.

Chairman Maughan confirmed that the commission has not approved in the past steel or metal roofing nor have they approved steel or vinyl siding. If this case is approved, it will be the first case.

Commissioner Bradshaw asked the chair what would be an alternative siding as like for like in this case will not work.

Commissioner Burwell asked the chair what other option is there that would not require removal of the asbestos siding.

Commissioner Dixon asked the applicant's representative what his assessment of the impact of weather on the house in the state that it is in now, how long it could stand if they asked for a little more time.

Mr. Burak responded that day to day, could tear apart.

Mr. Billingsley explained to the applicant's representative that they need to submit as exhibits copies of the building permits that they shared in the meeting.

Chairman Maughan reviewed the options of the commission and expressed the need of needed research.

Mr. Billingsley stated that exhibit labeled as HP-1000 is a letter from the City of Boise to Nadine Burak from 1992 and the remaining permits will be labeled as HP-1001.

Commissioner Bradshaw expressed her desire for more information on how the City of Boise would have decided or even in today's code how they would decide on this request.

Chairman Maughan shared that the commission has a situation and a question of what are the best practices and precedent for the Steunenburg Historic District. He doesn't feel the commission should make a decision that will they will regret in the future in terms of setting the precedent but also don't want to burden the applicant or residents in the district.

The commission members all agreed they did not want to set a precedent that steel siding is allowed and wants to know if there is another option or another way other than steel siding.

Mr. Billingsley gave a suggestion and asked for two weeks to consult with the City of Boise staff and receive a response in writing from the City of Boise staff to present at the next meeting to the commission and the applicant.

Chairman Maughan stated that he felt more comfortable with Mr. Billingsley's suggestion and noted the confirming nods from commission members that they agreed.

Motion to continue Case Number CA-17-01 to April 26, 2017 6:30 P.M.

MOTION: Commissioner Burwell **SECOND:** Commissioner Dixon **MOTION PASSED.**

V. Audience Participation. None.

VI. Actions Since Last Meeting.

April Cabello, Planning Technician reviewed the items under actions since the last meeting.

Case Number CA-16-06. Applicant: Josh & Sarah Andrade, a request for Certificate of Appropriateness approval for fencing. The subject property is located at 1722 Dearborn Street, Caldwell, ID 83605. Staff Level Approval approved by the Commission at a public meeting held on August 24, 2016 for a street side 6ft privacy fence setback 5' from the edge of the sidewalk.

Case Number CA-17-02. Applicant: James Nelson a request for Certificate of Appropriateness approval to replace a garage door. The subject property is located at 1323 Dearborn Street, Caldwell, ID 83605. Staff Level Approval approved by the Commission.

VII. Old Business. None.

VIII. New Business. None.

IX. Commission & Staff Reports.

Sundowner Motel Interpretive Signage: Brian B. reported that comments were submitted to SHPO and that the Historic Preservation Commission would like to review the signage and wording before it is approved.

1321 Blaine Street: April C. reported that this home had burned and the property owner is now looking to repair the damage by the fire. The insurance company has paid out the claim and he would like to start work. April C. explained that she informed the homeowner that repairs internally are okay to do without C of A but anything on the outside will require a Certificate of Appropriateness. Because this

was a fire, an act of god the existing nonconforming vinyl siding may be replaced with like vinyl siding as long as it is replaced within 1 year of the fire. A staff level Certificate of Appropriateness will need to be issued.

424 S. 20th Avenue: April C. reported that they are still working with the property owner regarding the street side fencing along Dearborn and that this may be appealed to City Council.

X. Meeting adjourned at approximately 7:55 p.m.

Respectfully submitted by April Cabello,
MINUTES APPROVED AND SIGNED BELOW BY CHAIRPERSON RANDY MAUGHAN
ON THE DATE NOTED BELOW.

Chairperson Maughan

Date

ATTEST: Brian Billingsley, Planning Director

Date

For detailed minutes, please request a copy of the digital recording.