

# CALDWELL HISTORIC PRESERVATION COMMISSION MINUTES

**Meeting of April 26, 2017 @ 6:30 P.M.  
Caldwell Public Library – Idaho Room  
1010 Dearborn, Caldwell, Idaho**

I. **Call to order.** Chairperson Maughan called the meeting to order at approximately 6:32 p.m.

II. **Roll Call**

**Members Present.** Steve Maughan, Randy Lyons, Jacob King, Nicole Bradshaw, Megan Dixon, and Don Burwell

**Members Absent.** None.

**Others Present.** Brian Billingsley, Planning & Zoning Director

**Others Absent.** April Cabello, Planning Technician and Rob Hopper, City Council Liaison.

III. **Approval of Minutes.** Continued to next meeting.

IV. **Certificate of Appropriateness Interviews.**

**Continued from April 12, 2017: Case No. CA-17-01.** Applicant: Jack Verdine. Represented by: ABC Seamless/Steve Burak. A request to alter the siding by replacing the beat-up, broken siding with Seamless T3 to make it look as originally constructed, but not altering the rafts, soffit, fascia, or window trims. Subject property is located at 1201 Cleveland Blvd.

Chairman Maughan re-opened the hearing and asked Mr. Billingsley to provide an update to the Commission on the items that staff has collected.

Mr. Billingsley submitted the following exhibits: HP-1000 (Letter from City of Boise), HP-1001 (Copies of Building Permits), HP-1002 (Email from Sarah Schafer of the City of Boise on building permits), HP-1003 (Email from Sarah Schafer of the City of Boise on City Council meeting minutes), HP-1004 (Email from Matt Halitsky of SHPO), HP-1005 (Email from Chris Bryant from Caldwell Building Department, and HP-1006 (Information on Asbestos Siding).

Commissioner King asked Mr. Burak if he attended any Historic Preservation Commission meetings after the City of Boise code changed to prohibit steel siding. Mr. Burak replied that he did not attend any of the meetings other than the City Council appeal meeting and possibly one other city council meeting.

Commissioner Dixon stated that according to the information supplied by the City of Boise changed their historic district boundaries and codes in 2001 and 2004 to prohibit steel siding in their historic districts. The Commission discussed this aspect and agreed that the work completed by Mr. Burak in the 1990's is grandfathered.

Chairman Maughan mentioned that the State Historic Preservation Commission is recommending that the applicant use a replacement of materials with wood or a non

textured lap siding to match the original siding. He also reminded the Commission that decisions like this are precedent setting.

Commissioner King asked Mr. Burak a question about the existing siding materials on the house. He also made a statement that this house is the first house on Cleveland Blvd. that is in the historic district and is concerned about placing steel siding on the first house in the district.

Mr. Burak asked questions to the Commission. He asked voting members to identify themselves. He asked how many members actually reside in the historical district. All but one member reside in the district. He asked if anyone on the Commission travelled to Boise to view the houses that he sided with steel siding. Nobody acknowledged viewing his homes, but Chairman Maughan stated that virtually everyone knows what steel siding looks like on a historical house. Mr. Burak stated that he drive through the district and found numerous homes with stucco, vinyl and aluminum siding. Chairman Maughan also acknowledged that several homes were re-sided with non-compliant materials before the Caldwell's historic district was created.

Mr. Burak asked what kind of material the Commission is going to approve. Mr. Billingsley replied that the Commission can approve the request for steel siding and place conditions on the approval if necessary or deny the request and place on the record the reasons for its denial and notify the applicant is writing as to what actions can be taken to obtain a certificate of appropriateness.

Chairman Maughan listed the various possibilities before the Commission. He said the Commission can: 1) approve the request. 2) deny with a recommendation of an alternative covering such as milled wood or hardy board. 3) deny with a recommendation of removing the insulating board to seal the existing asbestos siding as much as possible and remediate the various holes and entries that the application of the insulating board has created and ask that the house be returned to its previous state as much as possible. 4) deny with a recommendation to remove the asbestos siding and replace with an appropriate siding.

A discussion ensued between Commissioners on the various options. The Commission discussed the pro's and con's of approving the application. They also talked about recommending a code amendment to prohibit non-compliant materials in the historic district.

Commissioner Bradshaw asked what the cost difference is between steel and wood siding. Mr. Burak stated he is giving his client a great deal and the cost difference between wood and steel is great.

More discussion ensued between Commissioners on what they can do to help Mr. Verdine and codifying their desire to not allow non-compliant materials in the district.

Chairman Maughan closed the public testimony and asked the Commission to make a decision.

Motion was made by Commissioner Dixon to deny said request because it does not meet the Commission's guidelines. Recommended actions by the Commission to obtain a certificate of appropriateness:

1. Replace with compatible milled wood or cement board siding over existing boarding with flat profile with a standard reveal.

2. Remove the insulating board, repair any damage to existing asbestos siding, seal and paint.
3. Remove asbestos siding and replace with compatible siding material.

Motion seconded by Commissioner Burwell.

Motion approved unanimously.

Mr. Billingsley advised the applicant of his right to appeal this decision to the City Council and provided the proper paperwork.

- V. Audience Participation.** None.
- VI. Actions Since Last Meeting.** None.
- VII. Old Business.** None.
- VIII. New Business.** None.
- IX. Commission & Staff Reports.**

Staff Report:

- Mr. Billingsley invited members of the Commission to apply for a seat on the soon-to-be implemented Downtown Design Review Commission.
- Mr. Billingsley encouraged the Commission to look at the building at Kimball and Arthur. The owner is in the process of removing tin siding from the brick building that is on the National Register of Historical Places.
- Mr. Billingsley informed the Commission that the request to amend the Historical Society's agreement with Canyon County to replace the canopy in VanSlyke Museum has been approved.

**X. Meeting adjourned at approximately 8:00 p.m.**

Respectfully submitted by Brian Billingsley,

MINUTES APPROVED AND SIGNED BELOW BY CHAIRPERSON RANDY MAUGHAN ON THE DATE NOTED BELOW.

\_\_\_\_\_  
Chairperson Maughan

\_\_\_\_\_  
Date

\_\_\_\_\_  
ATTEST: Brian Billingsley, P&Z Director

\_\_\_\_\_  
Date

**For detailed minutes, please request a copy of the digital recording.**